

Exogeneity and Simultaneity

Professor V.M. Auken, PhD



Theorem

- i. Let $\hat{y} = Xb$ be the empirical predictor of y . Then \hat{y} has the same value for all solutions b of $X'Xb = X'y$.
- ii. $S(\beta)$ attains the minimum for any solution of $X'Xb = X'y$.

Proof:

- i. Let b be any member in $b = (X'X)^- X'y + [I - (X'X)^- X'X]\omega$

Since $X(X'X)^- X'X = X$, so then

$$\begin{aligned} Xb &= X(X'X)^- X'y + X[I - (X'X)^- X'X]\omega \\ &= X(X'X)^- X'y \end{aligned}$$

which is independent of ω . This implies that \hat{y} has same value for all solution b of $X'Xb = X'y$.

ii. Note that for any β ,

$$\begin{aligned} S(\beta) &= [y - Xb + X(b - \beta)]' [y - Xb + X(b - \beta)] \\ &= (y - Xb)'(y - Xb) + (b - \beta)' X' X (b - \beta) + 2(b - \beta)' X'(y - Xb) \\ &= (y - Xb)'(y - Xb) + (b - \beta)' X' X (b - \beta) \quad (\text{Using } X' X b = X' y) \\ &\geq (y - Xb)'(y - Xb) = S(b) \\ &= y' y - 2y' Xb + b' X' Xb \\ &= y' y - b' X' Xb \\ &= y' y - \hat{y}' \hat{y}. \end{aligned}$$

Fitted values

Now onwards, we assume that X is a full column rank matrix.

If $\hat{\beta}$ is any estimator of β for the model $y = X\beta + \varepsilon$, then the fitted values are defined as $\hat{y} = X\hat{\beta}$ where $\hat{\beta}$ is any estimator of β .

In case of $\hat{\beta} = b$,

$$\begin{aligned}\hat{y} &= Xb \\ &= X(X'X)^{-1}X'y \\ &= Hy\end{aligned}$$

where $H = X(X'X)^{-1}X'$ is termed as '**hat matrix**' which is

- i. symmetric,
- ii. idempotent (i.e., $HH = H$) and
- iii. $tr H = tr X(X'X)^{-1}X' = tr X'X(X'X)^{-1} = tr I_k = k$.

Residuals

The difference between the observed and fitted values of study variable is called as residual. It is denoted as

$$\begin{aligned}e &= y - \hat{y} \\ &= y - \hat{y} \\ &= y - Xb \\ &= y - Hy \\ &= (I - H)y \\ &= \bar{H}y\end{aligned}$$

where $\bar{H} = I - H$.

Note that

(i) \bar{H} is a symmetric matrix,

(ii) \bar{H} is an idempotent matrix, i.e., $\bar{H}\bar{H} = (I - H)(I - H) = (I - H) = \bar{H}$ and

(iii) $tr\bar{H} = trI_n - trH = (n - k)$.

Properties of OLSE

(i) Estimation error

The estimation error of b is

$$\begin{aligned} b - \beta &= (X'X)^{-1}X'y - \beta \\ &= (X'X)^{-1}X'(X\beta + \varepsilon) - \beta \\ &= (X'X)^{-1}X'\varepsilon. \end{aligned}$$

(ii) Bias

Since X is assumed to be nonstochastic and $E(\varepsilon) = 0$

$$\begin{aligned} E(b - \beta) &= (X'X)^{-1}X'E(\varepsilon) \\ &= 0. \end{aligned}$$

Thus OLSE is an unbiased estimator of β .

(iii) Covariance matrix

The covariance matrix of b is

$$\begin{aligned} V(b) &= E(b - \beta)(b - \beta)' \\ &= E\left[(X'X)^{-1}X'\varepsilon\varepsilon'X(X'X)^{-1}\right] \\ &= (X'X)^{-1}X'E(\varepsilon\varepsilon')X(X'X)^{-1} \\ &= \sigma^2(X'X)^{-1}X'IX(X'X)^{-1} \\ &= \sigma^2(X'X)^{-1}. \end{aligned}$$

(iv) Variance

The variance of b can be obtained as the sum of variances of all b_1, b_2, \dots, b_k which is the trace of covariance matrix of b .

Thus

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Var}(b) &= \text{tr}[V(b)] \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^k E(b_i - \beta_i)^2 \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^k \text{Var}(b_i). \end{aligned}$$

Estimation of σ^2

The least squares criterion can not be used to estimate σ^2 because σ^2 does not appear in $S(\beta)$. Since $E(\varepsilon_i^2) = \sigma^2$ so we attempt with residuals e_i to estimate σ^2 as follows:

$$\begin{aligned}e &= y - \hat{y} \\ &= y - X(X'X)^{-1}X'y \\ &= [I - X(X'X)^{-1}X']y \\ &= \bar{H}y.\end{aligned}$$

Consider the residual sum of squares

$$\begin{aligned}SS_{res} &= \sum_{i=1}^n e_i^2 \\ &= e'e \\ &= (y - Xb)'(y - Xb) \\ &= y'(I - H)(I - H)y \\ &= y'(I - H)y \\ &= y'\bar{H}y.\end{aligned}$$

Also

$$\begin{aligned}SS_{res} &= (y - Xb)'(y - Xb) \\ &= y'y - 2b'X'y + b'X'Xb \\ &= y'y - b'X'y \quad (\text{Using } X'Xb = X'y). \\ SS_{res} &= y'\bar{H}y \\ &= (X\beta + \varepsilon)'\bar{H}(X\beta + \varepsilon) \\ &= \varepsilon'\bar{H}\varepsilon \quad (\text{Using } \bar{H}X = 0).\end{aligned}$$

Since $\varepsilon \sim N(0, \sigma^2 I)$,

so $y \sim N(X\beta, \sigma^2 I)$.

Hence $y' \bar{H} y \sim \chi^2(n - k)$.

Thus $E[y' \bar{H} y] = (n - k)\sigma^2$

or $E\left[\frac{y' \bar{H} y}{n - k}\right] = \sigma^2$

or $E[MS_{res}] = \sigma^2$

Thus an unbiased estimator of σ^2 is

$$\hat{\sigma}^2 = MS_{res} = s^2 \text{ (say),}$$

which is a model dependent estimator.

where $MS_{res} = \frac{SS_{res}}{n - k}$ is the mean sum of squares due to residual.

Covariance matrix of \hat{y}

The covariance matrix of \hat{y} is

$$\begin{aligned}V(\hat{y}) &= V(Xb) \\ &= XV(b)X' \\ &= \sigma^2 X(X'X)^{-1}X' \\ &= \sigma^2 H.\end{aligned}$$

Gauss-Markov theorem

The ordinary least squares estimator (OLSE) is the best linear unbiased estimator (BLUE) of β

Proof: The OLSE of β is

$$b = (X'X)^{-1}X'y$$

which is a linear function of y . Consider the arbitrary linear estimator $b^* = a'y$ of linear parametric function $\ell'\beta$ where the elements of a are arbitrary constants.

Then for b^* ,

$$E(b^*) = E(a'y) = a'X\beta$$

and so b^* is an unbiased estimator of $\ell'\beta$ when

$$E(b^*) = a'X\beta = \ell'\beta$$

$$\Rightarrow a'X = \ell'.$$

Since we wish to consider only those estimators that are linear and unbiased, so we restrict ourselves to those estimators for which $a'X = \ell'$.

Proof:

Further

$$\text{Var}(a'y) = a'\text{Var}(y)a = \sigma^2 a'a$$

$$\text{Var}(\ell'b) = \ell'\text{Var}(b)\ell$$

$$= \sigma^2 a'X(X'X)^{-1}X'a.$$

Consider

$$\begin{aligned}\text{Var}(a'y) - \text{Var}(\ell'b) &= \sigma^2 [a'a - a'X(X'X)^{-1}X'a] \\ &= \sigma^2 a'[I - X(X'X)^{-1}X']a \\ &= \sigma^2 a'(I - H)a.\end{aligned}$$

Since $(I - H)$ is a positive semi-definite matrix, so

$$\text{Var}(a'y) - \text{Var}(\ell'b) \geq 0.$$

This reveals that if b^* is any linear unbiased estimator then its variance must be no smaller than that of b .

Proof:

If we consider $\ell = (0, 0, \dots, 0, 1, 0, \dots, 0)$ (here 1 occurs at i^{th} place), then $\ell' b = b_i$ is best linear unbiased estimator of $\ell' \beta = \beta_i$ for all $i = 1, 2, \dots, k$.

Consequently b is the best linear unbiased estimator of β , where 'best' refers to the fact that b is efficient within the class of linear and unbiased estimators.

QUESTIONS!

